'Sayyid Qutb was an outstanding personality from amongst the great figures of Islamic thought, from the men of contemporary Islamic Awakening….He possessed the true Imaanic stance, a person of Jihad, struggle, sacrifice, and sincerity to the Ummah. He enriched the Islamic heritage with masterpieces of work from literature and thought.'

Shaykh Ahmed Fareed,
Mawaaqif Imaaniyah

'I say that there is a chapter in this book (Milestones) which is of great benefit, called '*La ilaha illallah minhaj hayah*'……he (Sayyid Qutb) has written some words which I believe are like light from light *ilham* (inspiration)'

Shaykh Nasiruddeen al-Albani,
'al-I'tidal fee Sayyid Qutb'

'Sayyid Qutb is….'the most famous personality of the Muslim world in the second half of the 20th century.'

Robert Irwin,
Is this the man that inspired Bin Laden?

'Sayyid Qutb based his life upon, and what he dedicated his pen for: the D*a'wah* (call) towards *Tawhid* (monotheism) of Allah "in ruling and legislating," rejecting the man-made laws, and confronting those who committed that (legislating and ruling by other than Allah's rule).'

Shaykh Bakr Abu Zaid,
Office of the Presidency of Islamic Research and Legal Verdicts

'Sayyid Qutb (is) among the scholars of the Muslims and among the people of da'wah. Allah has brought benefit by (him) and through (him) He has guided many people.'

Shaykh Ibn Jibreen,
Office of the Presidency of Islamic Research and Legal Verdicts

'Sayyid Qutb (in) his now-celebrated book, *Ma'alim fi'l-tareeq* (Milestones)……..denounces the existing order in Muslim societies as *Jahiliyyahh*, provides guidelines for Muslim activists and describes the steps they must take to establish a society based on divine guidance.'

Zafar Bangash,
Institute of Contemporary Islamic Thought

'….We heard that the death sentence….on Imam Shahid Sayyid Qutb…..had been carried out….Such a great loss. Sayyid Qutb….a man who held fast to his religion, trusting in Allah's victory. Read Milestones to find out why Sayyid (Qutb) was executed.'

Zainab al-Ghazali
Return of the Pharaoh

Appendix III

Article A – 'Interview with the wife of Yusuf Hawwash (executed with Sayyid Qutb)'

We lived together for two years,
and he spent the rest of his life in prisons

Could you give us a brief introduction to the life of your husband Yusuf Hawwaash?

My husband is Muhammad Yusuf Hawwaash (May Allah have mercy upon him). He was born on the 12th of October 1922. He achieved a diploma from Industrial Schools in 1943. He joined the *Ikhwaan* (Muslim Brotherhood), during his studies in the Gharbiyyah province. He married me in 1953 and I had from him two children, Ahmad and Sumayyah. They are both now doctors, and each has four children, both male and female.

How did your marriage start?

One of the brothers recommended me to him as a wife, to help him carry the burden of the *da`wah* (calling to Allah). And he remained for a whole year, whenever he met my brother, saying "We are still on our agreement", but he did not propose because of problems his family was going through. At the end of the year, I told my brother to inform him that this matter was over. Indeed we ended the matter, then another brother came to propose to me, but then he [Yusuf] returned, to reiterate his request anew. So I refused, and my brother advised me to pray *Salaat-ul-Istikhaarah*. When I prayed, I saw myself in the reception of our house in the village, and there was no lighting. Then a bright lamp was hanging in front of me, in the shape of his face, so I agreed and the contract was made. He later told me that when he made *Istikhaarah*, he saw me making wudoo' with him pouring the water for me, and even though it was not much water, I did it well.

Your husband was imprisoned more than once during the beginning of your married life, so how did this situation pass?

He was imprisoned after the *Aqd* [contract], then when he was released, we married and stayed together for one year, then he was imprisoned in 1954 and after the sentence was passed, he gave me the choice of staying with him or divorce. So I reprimanded him harshly, and informed him of something he did not know. That once during our engagement, he was giving a talk in one of the open gatherings, and he fell unconscious, and was taken to hospital. Then we found that one of his kidneys was

severely damaged, because of an old illness he got when he was imprisoned as a student, in a cell filled with cold water in winter. [At that time] the brothers offered me to cancel [the engagement] if I wanted, but I refused not to be with him on this journey because of this situation that Allah Almighty had placed him in during one of his trials.

And when we married in 1953 I bore Sumayyah after ten months of marriage, and after that by 17 days, the security services came to arrest him, and we used to live in the same block as Anwar As-Sadat, who was the head of the Islamic Conference at the time. And because Muhammad's relationship was good with all those around him, the guards of Sadat warned him as he approached the block, i.e. that the security services were inside, so he stayed on the run for a while.

During this time, he came to visit me once, and the guards of Sadat saw him, but did not tell anyone, so he was able to return from where he had come. After this, one of my sisters came, to take me and host me during my husband's absence, but when we came to leave, we found the security services surrounding us, and they wanted to arrest me. So I decided that I would not go with them silently, until I exposed their evil system in front of the people who they had tricked, so I shouted in my highest voice that I would not go with them, whatever they do, and I criticized their actions. So Anwar Sadat came out and asked what was happening, so I replied: '*Demeaning of women and invasion of privacy is happening in this black era of yours.'* So he calmed me down, and told the officer to carry my bags and take me where I wanted. So I said to him: '*I am going to the house of your master and the crown over your head, the respected Murshid (al-Hudaybi) [the head of Ikwaan]'.* Indeed, I remained with the wife of the Murshid and his daughters alone in the house, because all the men in his family were in prison, until my husband appeared, and was tried and sentenced to a total of 55 years.

It is known that the shaheed Yusuf Hawwaash met his Lord in the same trial as the shaheed Sayyid Qutb, so how was their relationship?

Their relationship probably started after their sentencing in 1955, for he had been given 55 years, and the shaheed Sayyid Qutb 15; both were released in 1964. They remained throughout this period together, whether in prison or in hospital, so their relationship developed and strengthened for each other. They complemented each other and would find with the other something he needed - they would complete each other. Muhammad would benefit from and learn, the *Fikr* (thought), culture, *Ilm* (knowledge) and depth of the shaheed Sayyid, while Sayyid would learn about the history of *Ikhwaan*, their organization, *Manhaj* (methodology), and anything related to the *Jamaa`ah* (group) from the shaheed Muhammad, because he had joined before him. And so, they were very attached to each other. Muhammad would say: '*Every chapter and every phrase in the books of Ustaadh Sayyid, I know when it was written, what the occasion was, and the discussion about it when it appeared as it did.'*

And Muhammad saw Yusuf (as) [in a vision], while in Leemaan Turah, and Ustaadh Sayyid was writing on Surat-Yusuf in his book *Adh-Dhilaal* [In the Shade of the Qur'aan], and he [Yusuf (as)] said to him: "*Inform Sayyid that the surah has what he is looking for:* **{Indeed judgement is only for Allah}.**" And thus they remained until after their *shahhadah* (martyrdom), the brothers would say: "*Indeed it from the mercy of Allah over these two men, that He chose them both for martyrdom together, otherwise one would not be able to be patient with splitting from the other.*"

And what of his (last) imprisonment in 1965?

After his release in 1964, I went into hospital for an operation, and after coming out, and being cured by Allah's bounty, he wanted us to spend some time on his father's farm. So I informed him that staying there for a long time was hard on me, especially without a helper to help me with household duties, washing and other things. So he said to me: '*You should make dhikr and seek forgiveness during your work, and you will be rewarded, and have patience and Ihtisaab (looking to your reward in the Hereafter), in being good to your relatives.'* So I agreed, and we travelled. And on one of the days straight after our travel, he informed me that he would pray two *rak`ahs*, (units of prayer) until the food was prepared, and he continuously prayed from nine in the morning to two in the afternoon. Whenever I opened the door, I would find him praying and crying. Until we heard a bang at the door of the house, and found it was the security services. So I opened the door to his room, and informed him that the security services were there and that he should finish his prayer and see them. And he did just that. They tried to take him with them, but he asked them to leave him until he could make ghusl. He then asked me extensively for a *Mushaf* [copy of the Qur'aan], but I did not have except the one which I had written a small message to Ahmad [the son] and was going to give him as a present. So he promised me that it would return to me even if it had to go to Mars and back, so I gave it to him.

Then the oppression of the regime began to increase in harshness. For after I had been transferred from a headmistress to a teacher, then from one province to another, then from normal teaching to special needs, in his first period of imprisonment, the security services started their campaign to imprison me. Until eventually, they achieved what they wanted and I was imprisoned for six months in Al-Qanaatir prison, which I spent in constant *nazeef* [bleeding], until I had an operation to remove my womb after that. And so, I did not attend except the sentencing. When he saw me in my weak state, he informed me that he did not know of my imprisonment, until the dogs had ripped his clothes, and he had sent for clothes from the house, and so Ahmad gave the guard old clothes so that they would not steal the new clothes. And when he saw them, he knew that I was not in the house.

In this painful situation was when my sister bore a daughter, and Ahmad asked me to have for him a sister, and he would nag and cry, so I said: '*Your father has to be here.*', and when we went to visit his father, he kept crying and pulling him saying: '*Come with me*

father to the house, and mum can have a sister for me. Who is stopping you? Him?' and he pointed to the guard, *'Don't be scared of him, I will hit him, and you come with me.',* until he made me cry and subsequently made the guards cry.

Describe to us the final moments of your farewell. How were they?

The asked us to pay the final visit to him, before the carrying out of the sentence, so I took Ahmad and Sumayyah with me. I prepared for him good food, and we went to see him, but they refused to let me take the food in. They kept taking us into a tent to wait for some time, then taking us to another, until we had been into four tents, and in the end the guards brought him, dragging him in a derogatory manner, and 'threw' him in front of us inside the tent. And Muhammad would say: *'I don't know what to be regretful over? They want me to put forward an apology and regret over what I have done, but what have I done to be regretful over?'*

And when I asked the officer to bring in the food, and he refused, Muhammad said to me: *"Don't tire yourself, and waste the time that we can spend together. If they bring the food in, then they will insist that I eat now, and I am fasting." Ahmad went and sat on his father's lap and kept crying saying: "The boys keep saying to me, you whose father wanted to kill Abdul-Nasser". So the shaheed replied to him: "The scales today are reversed, and they will not be corrected today, indeed:* ***'We Shall set up the Scales of Justice for the Day of Judgment.'***

He advised me to good with the children, and I advised him to good with himself, and the visit ended. On the morning of 29th of August 1966, at [number missing] in the morning, the radio broadcast the news that the sentence had been carried out on the three Martyrs. And I was preparing breakfast at the time, so I kept saying *'Inna lillaahi wa innaa ilayhi raaji`oon'*, and seeking forgiveness, with my tears not stopping, while no-one was aware of my situation. The murderers were not content with this, and sent for me, and made me sign acceptance that there would not be a *janaazah* (funeral prayer) for him, and they gave me his things but Ahmad's *Mushaf* (Qur'an) was not amongst them.

This great faithfulness to the shaheed and his da`wah. How did it grow in you and what were its reasons?

He (may Allah have mercy on him), was of kind manners. One of his most important attributes was his generosity. The helper who used to work for him, once complained to me after the *Aqd* (marriage contract), that he did not eat from the food that she would prepare, because his house was always open to the brothers who were students, away from home or in hardship. Whether he was there or not, they would come in and eat, wear whatever of his clothes they wished and sometimes take his money, then he would come back and eat cheese and halaawah from the grocers.

Similarly *Ithaar* [preference of others]. He would not accept at all that there could be a misunderstanding between him and his brothers. Just as he was clean in body and manners. He would make ghusl more than five times a day apart from wudoo'.

Your relationship with the shaheed husband strengthened despite the short time you spent together, so how did you discover these good characteristics in him?

His letters from prison were *Tarbiyah* [educative] lessons in *Aaqeedah* [belief], *Imaan* [faith], *Sabr* [patience], and *Istiqamaah* [steadfastness]. They were a provision for me on this path, and here are some examples:

On *Eed-ul-fitr* he sent a letter saying: '*Eed would come to the sahaabah, and the honourable of them had been martyred, the loved of them had been lost, and they would have been tested in their spouses, parents and children. But all of this would not dampen the happiness of `eed in their souls. In fact this was the real meaning of `eed, effort, work, and sacrifice. So we, with what we are in, are the most rightful of people to celebrate `eed, and the most real in our happiness for what Allah has given us, and for our knowing Him. And to have thankfulness to Allah for it, on this great day. We now taste this deen, and feel it, and we find it in our khalajaat, fresh and soft just like the day it was revealed, alive and beating in our hearts and our blood mixing with it.*'

Just as he was gentle in feelings, he would place his hand on the place of pain, and would nurse it with softness, and gentle medicine. He says in another letter;

"It is hard on me, while I spend these moments with you, to see on you the signs of struggle and the indications of tiredness, and it is as if the journey has been long, and the hardships heavy. And I do not deny the hardships on this path, and I do not claim that I do not feel its difficulty, for indeed I am a weak human. Except that I feel, and I would like you to feel with me, that on either side of this long path, are oases with shade, that passers-by can relax in, if they tire, and in whose shade travellers can rest whenever the toils of travel take their toll. So would you like that we turn to one of these oases, perhaps we may find in it cool and calm? Then we can take from it water and food, which will help us continue our journey, and finish our travel?"

And here is what he wrote in a copy of the Book of Allah Almighty which he gave to me as a present:

"In the Name of Allah the Most Gracious the Most Merciful,

To you. To you my wife.

To you O sister in creed.

To you O partner in Jihad.

To you O calmness of the soul and mother of the child.

To you O flower of the heart. To you this great book, upon whose law Allah brought us together as spouses, through which He gathered us as brothers, and in whose path He made us in the ranks of the believers two soldiers.

To you my beloved this grand book, in appreciation, love and faithfulness from your husband. Lest Allah may bring me back to you, and gather us under His aim.

And peace be upon you, and mercy from Allah, and His blessings, and all praise is due to Allah, Lord of the worlds.

12th Shawwaal 1383

Aside from these soft letters, did you hear anything about his life in prison?

Yes, I heard a lot from his brothers speaking about him. One of the brothers had asked him which season was his favourite, and he replied: *'Autumn, as the falling of the leaves reminds me of the end of one's allotted time.'*

He also saw the Prophet ﷺ more that once, and Yusuf (as) and `Eesaa (as), and he would have true visions. He informed one of his brothers that once in a moment of unconsciousness during his *sujood* [prostration] during the night, that the cells were opened for them to leave and men from the security services was put in them, and this happened after 1967. And he saw himself with a group of the *sahaabah* (companions), giving *bay`ah* (oath of allegiance) to the Prophet ﷺ, and when his turn came, to give *bay`ah*, he said: *"Oh Messenger of Allah, have we changed things after you? Have we replaced things after you?*" So he replied: "*No, but you are trustworthy, trustworthy, trustworthy."*

His brothers say that if he would become very tired in the queues he would say: '*Yes my Lord, how gentle you are.'* And if they spoke about torture in front of him, he would reply: ***(…then leave them in their wasteful discourse and trifling)*** (Al-An`aam:91)

And if they discussed with him the expectations of sentences, he would say: *"Indeed these do not judge, and for Allah is judgment, and Allah does not judge except by the truth and those who they call upon beside him, do not judge by anything. What are we and they while in the qabd [literal: grasp] of Allah like an atom? If Allah sees us as worthy of Martyrdom, He will choose us for it, and if not, then Allah's qadar will pass us and them."*

We spoke about his visions, so what of your visions of him?

After his Martyrdom, I saw myself in the village in which his sister lives, standing behind her house and in front of me, the field extending with no end, as if I was lost. Then a great bird came over the fields, and it was huge in size, then I saw it again, standing on a pole that reached into the sky, and between its feet, my son Ahmad, standing, and pointing me to a path, the end of which I could not see. On it were marching lines of the *Ikhwaan*, so I went to look at the situation, and I saw the moon, extremely huge, and very bright, at the end of this path.

And after his Martyrdom also, his father went to hajj, and when he returned, I called him to come and lighten the sadness of the children because of the leaving of their father, and I called his other children and grandchildren. But I found him completely ignoring my children and taking interest in the others, and I saw the sadness on the face of my daughter Sumayyah, and I was depressed and unhappy all day. So I slept while I was sad for her, then I saw the shaheed Muhammad bend over next to the bed and say: *"Don't be sad, I accept your right."*

You said that Ahmad's Mushaf (Qur'an) has a story so what is it?

When they imprisoned him in 1965, and he took the *mushaf* [Qur'an] with him, I did not find it in the belongings after his Martyrdom. And after twenty years, while we were in Madeenah, in the house of my daughter and her husband, I saw it on the shelves, so I asked my daughter's husband where he got this *mushaf* from so he said that during his being in the *haram*, a woman heard his brothers calling him, so she went to him, and said: *'Are you so and so?'*, do he replied in the affirmative. She said: *'Then wait for me and do not leave until I give you a trust.'* Then she informed him that her husband had given her this *mushaf* that he had taken from the shaheed and told her to take it to his relatives. And that this *mushaf* had been to France, London and Saudi Arabia, until it eventually reached us 20 years later. And I do not expect that Allah Almighty had fulfiled the promise of the shaheed.

If I asked you to send him a letter today, what would you write?

I pray to Allah Almighty that I am still upon the covenant, and have not changed after you, and that you are now in the levels of the S*huhadaa* [Maryrs] and *Sideeqeen* [Truthful], and that Allah Almighty gathers me with you: ***(They and their wives in groves of shade, reclining on thrones)*** (Surah Yaa-Seen:56).

Taken from Ad-Da'wah Issue 109, Muharram 1422 (www.cageprisoners.com)

Appendix IV

Article B - '*al-I'tidaal Fee Sayyid Qutb*' Q&A with Shaykh Al-Albani

The following is an extract from a question and answer session with Shaykh al-Albani. It was recorded on a tape by Abi Lailatal Athari and it is commonly sold under the title, *'al-I'tidaal Fee Sayyid Qutb'*. The date of the recording is *1st of Rabi' al Awwal 1414H* – 9th December 1993.[1]

TRANSCRIPT:

Questioner: (Alleges that Sayyid Qutb pronounced everyone a '*Kafir*' – disbeliever)

Al-Albani: 'We do not know this about him. Rather he has composed words during his stay in prison which are akin to inspiration.

Questioner: Sayyid Qutb claimed that the *Ummah* lives in a state of *Jahiliyyahh* which is worse than the first state of *Jahiliyyahh*. He has also claimed that the *Masajids* are akin to the temples of *Jahiliyyahh* and that Islam does not apply to such societies. I heard this myself, Shaykh.

Al-Albani: Have you been to Egypt?

Questioner: No, I have not.

Al-Albani: He is an Egyptian. He is describing what he has seen in the likes of mosques in Egypt such as Sayyida Zaynab, Sayyid Badawi, etc.

Questioner: Are all mosques in Egypt like that?

Al-Albani: No. I do not say all mosques are like that and neither does Sayyid Qutb. Rather, he is giving a general statement.

Questioner: Did you comment that *'Ma'alim fil-Tareeq'* (Milestones) is about *Tawheed* (monotheism) written in a modern way?

Albani: I say that there is a chapter in this book which is of great benefit, called '*La ilaha illallah minhaj hayah'*. That is what I am saying and as I have said before, Sayyid Qutb is not a scholar but rather he has written some words which I believe are like light from light *ilham* (inspiration)[2] including the chapter 'Way of Life'. A large number of Salafees have not adopted what the

---

[1] *Silsilatul Hudaa wan-Noor (784/1*).
[2] Ilham - in Arabic means 'inspiration for certain chosen individuals.'

chapter 'Way of Life' discusses. 'Milestones' has many interesting points and discussions.

END OF TRANSCRIPT

Some groups have alleged that this recording took place prior to Shaykh al-Albani's discovery of the 'evil' of Sayyid Qutb. There is no evidence to suggest that Shaykh al-Albani retracted these comments and it must also be borne in mind that at the time of this recording it had been nearly 30 years since the Martyrdom of Sayyid Qutb.

Shaykh Albani uses the word *ilham*, which in Arabic means *'inspiration for certain chosen individuals.'* This word is often used by scholars to describe an act or deed which is guided by Allah Almighty. For example scholars uses the same word when describing how the mother of Prophet Musa was inspired to put her infant child into a basket of reeds and floated him on the river Nile to save him from Pharoah's men.

Appendix V

Article C – 'Letter from Shaykh Bakr Abu Zayd to Rabee bin Hadee al-Madkhali'

'The respected brother, sheikh Rabee bin Hadee Al-Madkhali,

Assalamu Alaikum wa rahmatullahi wa barakatuh…

I draw your attention to **your** request from me to read the book attached: ***"Adwa' Islamiyyah 'Ala 'Aqeedat Sayyid Qutb Wa Fiqrih**."* (Islamic lights on the Aqeedah & Ideas of Sayyid Qutub)… Are there any notes against it? And whether these notes mean that this project should be disregarded and never be narrated again? Or is it considered from which that can be edited and qualified to be printed and distributed to serve as a reward for you in the Day of Judgment, and as a guidance to those whom Allah wills from his servants?

[Answer] Thus I say the following:

1- I looked into the first page where the index of topics are listed, and I found topics against Sayyid Qutb, may Allah have mercy on him, that collects the basics of kufr, atheism, heresy, belief in Wahdat Al-Wujood, the saying that the Quran is created, the saying that it is permissible for other than Allah to legislate, the exaggeration in glorifying the attributes of Allah, not accepting the Mutawatir Ahadeeth, doubts in matters of Aqeedah that one must be certain about it, making takfeer on communities …etc from such topics that makes the believer's hair stand on end.

I felt sorry for the Muslim scholars around the world who did not pay attention to such destructive matters. Then I wondered why with such destructive matters, we find the spread of the books of Qutb on the horizon like the spread of the sun, the common people benefit from them, and even you (Rabee Al-Madkhali) in some of your writings. Therefore, I started comparing the topics with the contents. I found that the contents prove the opposite of other contents; and these topics, in general, are some provocative topics to withdraw the attention of the regular reader to bash Sayyid (Qutb), may Allah have mercy on him. I hate for you, me and all of the Muslims (to fall into) the zones of sin…It is from deception when a person talks about the good in front of whom he hates.

2- I looked, and found that this book (Rabee al-Madkhalee's) lacks: the basis of the scholarly research, the *Manhaj* (methodology) of criticism, the trust of quoting (from others sources), the trust of knowledge, (and) not transgressing on others.

Regarding the etiquette of dialogue, the goodness of the approach, and the strength of introducing the material, then the above have nothing to do with this book by any mean… the proofs are:

First, I saw that you depended in quoting old editions of the books of Sayyid Qutb, like the books: *Fee Thilaal Al-Qur'an, Al'Adalah Al Ejtima'eyyah*, while knowing, as in the margin of page 29 and other (places), that there are some revised editions that came afterwards. It is obligatory according to the basics of criticism and the trust of knowledge to criticize - if it was about the contents of the *last* edition of any book because the changes in it (i.e. the last edition) abrogate the previous ones. This thing, *InshAllah* (God-willing), is not hidden from your basic information, but it is probably a mistake of a student who prepared this information for you who was not aware of that.

It is well known that there are many similar situations for the people of knowledge, for example the book, *Al Rooh*, of Ibn Qayyim, when many scholars looked into it they said: it is probably issued during his early life. This also happened in many cases. The book (of Sayyid Qutb) *Al'Adalah Al Ejtima'yah* was the first (book) that he (Sayyid Qutb) authored about Islamic issues.

Second, the topic in the index of this book: Sayyid Qutb allows other than Allah to legislate, made my hair stand on end. I rushed to this topic before anything else. What I found out is just a single quote from lots of lines in his book, *Al'Adalah AlEjtima'yah*. His sayings do not confirm this provocative topic. Let us suppose that there is a general or vague sentence, why do we turn it into a *takfeeri* (blasphemy) matter against him to destroy what Sayyid Qutb based his life upon and what he dedicated his pen for: the *Da'wah* towards *Tawheed* (monotheism) of Allah Almighty "in ruling and legislating," rejecting the man made laws, and confronting those who committed that (legislating and ruling by other than Allah's rule). Allah Almighty loves justices and fairness in every thing; and I do not see *InshaAllah* except that you are about to go back to justice and fairness.

Third: One of the provocative topics is your topic: Sayyid Qutb believes in Wahdat Al-Wujood. Verily, Sayyid Qutb, may Allah have mercy on him, said something not clear (that might make the reader think that he believes in Wahdat Al-Wujood) using the style (of literature) in commenting on Surat Al-Hadeed, and Surat Al-Ekhlaas, and based upon it the accusation that he believes in Wahdat Al-Wujood was made. You did something good when you quoted his saying in commenting on Surat Al-Baqarah, and his (Sayyid Qutb) clear rejection to the idea of Wahdat Al-Wujood. From these quotes (Sayyid Qutb wrote): "*and from here we find that there is nothing in the true Islamic ideology called the idea of Wahdat Al-Wujood*." To add, in his (Qutb) book: "*Muqawwimat At-Tasawwur Al-Islami*" there is a clear response to those who belief in Wahdat Al-Wujood. Therefore, we say may Allah forgive Sayyid Qutb for these vague statements that he expanded upon using his literal style; and what is vague does not overcome the clear cut statements from his saying.

Thus, I wish that you rush into deleting this hidden *takfeer* (pronouncement of apostasy) of Sayyid Qutb, and I feel sorry for you.

Fourth, I say clearly to you with all respect, that under these topics: the contrary of what Sayyid Qutb commented on the meaning of *La Ilaha Illah Allah*, to the scholars and the people of language; and that he (Qutb) is not clear about (tawheed) Ar-Ruboobiyah and Al-Uloohiyyah. I say to you, my beloved, that you have destroyed, without making sure, all of what Sayyid (Qutb), may Allah have mercy on him, confirmed from the aspects of Tawheed and what it necessitates and confirms, which occupied the major aspect of the long life of Sayyid Qutb.

All what you (Rabee Al-Madkhali) said is nullified by one word: that the monotheism of Allah in legislation and ruling is from the necessities of the word of Tawheed. Sayyid, May Allah have mercy on him, emphasized on this a lot when he saw the corrupted courage to dismantle the legislations of Allah from courts and other places, and replacing it with man-made laws. Without a doubt, this is a great courage (the courage of changing the rules of Allah) that the Ummah never experienced before 1342 Hijri.

Fifth: from the topics of the index: "Sayyid Qutb confirms the belief that the Quran is created, and that the speech of Allah is just the will"… When I went back to the pages that talk about that, I did not find a single letter where Sayyid Qutub, may Allah have mercy on him, declared this saying: "The Quran is created." How do you easily accuse with these takfeeri matters? The only sentence that I noticed is his (Qutb) saying: *"They cannot author from it—the Muqat'ah letters—a book similar to this book because this book is created by Allah and not by the humans"*… There is no doubt that this sentence is wrong, but does this sentence make us rule that Sayyid Qutb confirms the disbelief saying that the Quran is created?

O Allah I cannot tolerate the burden of this! This reminded me of a similar saying of Shaykh Muhammad 'Abdulkhaliq 'Atheemah, may Allah have mercy on him, in his book's introduction: *Studies on the style of the Noble Quran*, that is printed by the Islamic University of Imam Muhammed bin Sa'ud. Do we accuse all people by the saying that the Quran is created? O Allah No. What we mentioned so far is sufficient in talking about the subjective perspectives, and this is the important matter.

Talking about other perspectives:

1- The original copy of this book lies in 161 pages written by hand. These writings are different. I do not know of a single page written by you as usual, unless your handwriting differed from usual, or I missed up something, or you gave the job about Sayyid Qutb to some of the students, and each student wrote what he found under your supervision, or by your dictation. Therefore, I cannot confirm that this book belongs to you except by what you wrote on

it that it is authored by you, and that is enough in considering it to belong to you.

2- Even though there are differences in the handwritings, there is a common trend, This book has the common trend of the disturbing manner, the continuous anger, the same jump on the sentence to generate huge mistakes, rushing into conclusions where there is a possibility to prove otherwise, and depending on the vague sentences and leaving the clear ones, which is a solid rule that do not accept any argument about it….This is considered as betraying (violating) the Manhaj of criticism (named): *Al'Haydah Al'Elmiyah*.

3- Regarding the style of literature, if we were to compare it with the style of Sayyid Qutb, then this style is of descending style. The style of Sayyid (Qutb) is high. If we considered it as your (Rabee's) style, then it is very elementary, and does not suit a student of knowledge who has great degrees. So there should be a balance between the literal taste, the ability of using the language and clearly presenting the matter, and the beauty of presenting; or otherwise the pen should be broken (i.e. otherwise do not bother writing it).

4- The common trend was the trend of anger and frightening which overtook the scientific Manhaj of criticism, thus your response lacked the etiquettes of dialogue.

5- This book from its beginning tells the end has an offensive trend and narrowness in mind and lack of patience in the sentences… why?

6- This book creates a new *hizbiyah* that establishes the trend of making *tahreem* here, and nullifying it there; and to call this a bid'ah and that person a *Mubtadi' (Innovator)* to call this deviancy and that person a deviant… without enough proofs. This also generates *ghuroor* (i.e. deception) of being religious, being proud to the extent that when one of them does that he (thinks that he) gets rid of a huge burden from his back; and that he is saving the Ummah from falling from an edge; that he is considered of a high example of *Wara'* (fearing Allah) and *gheerah* (jealousy) on the rulings of *Shari'ah*. This (Judging) without making sure, is a way of destruction, even if it is considered as a high constructed building, its destiny is destruction and disappearance with the winds.

These are six aspects that this book enjoys, which made it not enjoyable. This is what I see regarding what you requested. I apologize for being late to respond to you, but I used not to read the books of this man (Sayyid Qutb), even though it is popular amongst the people. However, the dangerous remarks that you talked about made me do lots of readings into his books, and I found in his books many good things, a great faith, clear truth, exposing the plans of the enemies of Islam, and some mistakes in the contents and saying some things that I wish he never said. He nullifies lots of these things in other places, and to be perfect is hard. This man was a great writer and a great criticizer, and then he moved towards serving Islam through the great Quran, the noble Sunnah, and the beautiful Seerah. This shaped his attitude regarding the issues of his time. He insisted on his attitude (to continue what he is

doing) for the sake of Allah. He also clarified the issues about his past. It was requested from him to write some words of apology, and he said his faithful and famous word, that *"I will not use the finger which I raise for shahadah (i.e. calling to Tawheed) to write something against Tawheed…"* or a word close to this.

Therefore, the obligation of everyone is to make du'a for him that Allah forgive his sins, to benefit from his knowledge, to clarify his mistakes, and that his mistakes do not make us not benefit from his knowledge, or to abandon his books. Consider, may Allah protect you, his situation like the situation of those of the salaf like Isma'eel Al-Harawi and Al-Jilaani, and how Shaykh-ul-Islam Ibn Taymiyyah defended them, even though they fell into many awful mistakes, because the basis of their approach was to defend Islam and the Sunnah. Look to the (book), *"Manazil Alsa'ereen"*, and you will find strange things that cannot be accepted; however, you find Ibn Al-Qayyim, may Allah have mercy on him, making excuses for him and not accusing him, as he clarified it in the book *"Madarij As-Saalikeen"*. I also expanded on this matter in the book "Classifying the people between doubts and certainty," and I put some rules regarding it.

In conclusion, I advise the brother in Allah, not to print this book *"Adwa' Islamiyyah.."*. It is not permissible for this book to be distributed or printed because of what it has of the exaggeration, and the training of the youth of the Ummah to slander the *Ulama'* (scholars), and to put down and disregard their virtues. Forgive me, may Allah bless you, if I was harsh in my sentences, but it is because of what I saw from your exaggeration, because I want the good for you, and because your eagerness to know what I have about him. This is what my pen wrote, and may Allah correct the way of all of us.

Wa assalamu alaykum wa rahmatullahi Wa barakatahu

(Shaykh) Bakr Abu Zayd

Appendix VI

Article D – 'Fatwah (legal verdict) regarding Sayyid Qutb' by Shaykh Ibn Jibreen

Question: Some youth call Shaykh Sayyid Qutb a heretic and prohibit the reading of his books, and they say a similar statement regarding Imam Hasan al-Banna, as they also say regarding some of the scholars that they are *Khawarij*. Their argument is that [they do this] in order to 'expose the errors [of these men] to the people,' even though [these youth] are until now [only] students [of knowledge]. I hope for a response so that doubt may be removed from us and others, [and] so that this [phenomenon] will not spread.

Response: All praise belongs to Allah alone. To proceed: It is impermissible to [unjustly] call the Muslims heretics or wicked as is evidenced by the statement of the Prophet ﷺ "*Whoever says to his brother 'O enemy of Allah,' and he is not such but that it returns back to him.*" While in [another] hadith "*Whoever calls a Muslim an infidel it returns back to one of them*.' While in another hadith: *"A man passed by another while he was doing a sin and he said to him, 'By Allah, Allah will not forgive you.' So [Allah] said: 'Who is he who can pass judgment on my behalf that I will not forgive so and so? I have forgiven him and have nullified your deeds.'*

With this I say, Sayyid Qutb and Imam Hasan al-Banna are among the scholars of the Muslims and among the people of *Da'wa*. Allah has brought benefit by them and through them He has guided many people. They both have efforts [for Islam] which should not be denied. For this reason Shaykh Abdul-Aziz ibn Baz interceded on behalf of Sayyid Qutb when the order for his execution was given. [Ibn Baz] was gentle in his intercession, but President Gamal [Abdel Nasser] did not accept [Ibn Baz's] intercession, may Allah send upon him [i.e. Abdel Nasser] what he deserves. When both men [i.e Imam Hasan al-Banna & Sayyid Qutb] were killed, each was referred to as a *Shaheed* (Martyr), as each was killed unjustly. This is borne witness to by those close [to them] as well as by the general public - as it was widely spread in the papers and books without anyone ever objecting.

Moreover, the scholars have received their books [with acceptance]. No one has attacked them for more than the [last] twenty years. If some [heresy proceeded] from them, then [these mistakes] are similar to an-Nawawi, as-Suyuti, Ibn al-Jawzi, Ibn 'Atiyah, al-Khatabi, al-Qastalani and the likes of many of them. I have read what… Rabee al-Madkhali has written in his refutation of Sayyid Qutb and I found that he has placed statements where they do not exist. For this reason Shaykh Bakr Abu Zaid, may Allah preserve him, refuted him. Likewise, [al-Madkhali's] unjust attacks of Shaykh 'Abdur-Rahman ['Abdul-Khaaliq] and his [twisting 'Abdur-Rahman 'Abdul-Khaaliq's words] in order to find errors which would make ['Abdur-Rahman 'Abdul-Khaaliq

appear] misguided, even though [al-Madkhali] befriended him for a lengthy period of time and he never found any such errors [in the past].

And the eye of pleasure sees every fault insignificant,

But the eye of hatred always finds fault.

Dictated by
Abdullah ibn Abdur-Rahman ibn Jibreen
26/2/1417 AH

Office of the Presidency of Islamic Research and Legal Verdicts